Introduction

*Pasteurella multocida* and *Mannheimia haemolytica* are commensals and also opportunistic pathogens in multifactorial BRD [1,2]. In cattle, BRD is a leading cause of morbidity and mortality [3]. Pathogenesis of BRD depends on multiple factors, such as the animal host, the environment, and involved pathogens [1,2]. Of these, *P. multocida* is an important causative agent in the development of BRD [4]. *M. haemolytica* is a major cause of severe fibrinous pleuroneumonia [5]. Clinical signs of infection involve respiratory distress, cough, fever, nasal discharge, and inappetence associated with weight loss [1,4,6].

Often, antimicrobials are used for metaphylactic or therapeutic treatment of clinical BRD. A European study observed a still high susceptibility of *P. multocida* and *M. haemolytica* isolated from diseased, antimicrobial non-treated cattle against licensed antibiotics [7]. However, in North America, the prevalence of non-susceptible respiratory tract isolates in diseased animals is steadily increasing...
Results

In microdilution, cinnamon cassia and lemongrass oil showed the strongest antibacterial activity against *P. multocida* with median MICs of 0.0078 and 0.0313%, respectively (▶ Fig. 1a). Coriander, winter savory, and thyme oil had an MIC of 0.125%, followed by clove (MIC of 0.1875%), peppermint (MIC of 0.25%), and eucalyptus and wintergreen oil (both: MIC of 0.5%). The weakest EOs were spruce (MIC of 1.0%) and star anise oil (MIC > 1.0%). It is important to mention that wintergreen oil immediately precipitated in the broth at the bottom of the well. Therefore, the visual determination of the MIC for wintergreen oil was not distinct. The MBC differed from the MIC, except for winter savory, thyme, and eucalyptus oil (▶ Fig. 1a). For several bacterial isolates, the MBC and MIC differed by one dilution step. This applies for spruce (10% of isolates), coriander, clove, peppermint oil (20–26% of isolates), lemongrass (43% of isolates), and cinnamon cassis oil (67% of isolates). For wintergreen and star anise oil, the MIC and MBC were not always possible to determine. MICs that did not have bactericidal effects led to a reduction of bacterial growth on plated agar plates, in contrast to growth controls. In agar disc diffusion, lemongrass oil (median IZR: 30.13 mm, interquartile range: 7.31) most effectively inhibited the growth of *P. multocida*, followed by cinnamon cassia (22.25 mm, 2.38), thyme (18.5 mm, 2.38), winter savory (16.75 mm, 0.94), coriander (15.00 mm, 2.88), wintergreen (14.5 mm, 1.25), peppermint (13.5 mm, 2.38), and clove oil (11.25 mm, 1.88) (▶ Fig. 1b). Comparison of the results of agar disc diffusion and microdilution of *P. multocida* (▶ Fig. 2) revealed two major differences in EO activity. Cinnamon cassis oil was much less effective than expected from the microdilution results. Wintergreen oil showed better activity in agar disc diffusion than expected from the microdilution results, where precipitation of the EO occurred. The other EOs showed concordant results of both methods. Thyme, winter savory, and coriander oil had similar activity in agar disc diffusion (IZR of 18.5–15.00 mm) and the same MIC (0.125 %) in microdilution. Peppermint and clove oil also showed similar activity in agar disc diffusion (IZR of 13.5–11.25 mm) and microdilution (MIC values of 0.25 and 0.1875%). Star anise, spruce, and eucalyptus oil had the weakest activity in both agar disc diffusion (IZR of 7.50–5.00 mm) and microdilution (MIC of 0.5 %–>1.0%).

Isolates of *M. haemolytica* and bacteria in the *Mannheimia* clade were most efficiently inhibited by cinnamon cassis and thyme oil in agar disc diffusion (▶ Fig. 3). *M. haemolytica* was also inhibited by wintergreen, lemongrass, winter savory, clove, coriander, peppermint, and star anise oil in descending order. Bacteria in the *Mannheimia* clade were also inhibited by winter savory, coriander, wintergreen, lemongrass, peppermint, clove, and star anise oil. Eucalyptus and spruce oil only yielded small or no inhibition zones against all bacterial isolates. A two-way ANOVA was conducted to examine the effect of bacterial isolates and EOs on the size of the IZR. There was a statistically significant interaction between the EO and bacterial isolate (F = 12.37, df = 20, 279, p < 0.001). Predominantly, *P. multocida* isolates were more susceptible than *Mannheimia* isolates, except for star anise and eucalyptus oil (▶ Fig. 3).

Additionally, agar disc diffusion of EO mixtures, composed of the most potent single EOs, was performed. All EO mixtures showed antibacterial activity against all bacterial isolates (Fig. 15, ▶).
Supporting Information). A two-way ANOVA was conducted that examined the effect of bacterial isolates and EO mixtures on the size of the IZR. There was no interaction between the EO and bacterial isolate (F = 1.14, df = 12, 189, p = 0.328), but the bacterial isolate (F = 266.44, df = 2, 189, p < 0.001) as well as the EO mixture (F = 8.01, df = 6, 189, p < 0.001) had an effect on the size of the IZR. Multiple comparison of the main effects revealed that *P. multocida* was more susceptible against the EO mixtures than *M. haemolytica* (p < 0.001) and bacteria in the *Mannheimia* clade (p < 0.001). *M. haemolytica* was also more susceptible than bacteria in the *Mannheimia* clade (p < 0.001) (Fig. 1S, Supporting Information). The EO mixtures did not exceed antibacterial activity of the single EOs (Fig. 2S, Supporting information).

**Discussion**

The analysis of antimicrobial activity of EOs is lacking standardised methods and is demanding due to their complexity, water insolubility, and volatility [20]. In agar disc diffusion, the size of the inhibition zone of bacterial growth depends on the diffusion of the EO components into the agar, which could be impaired by their hydrophobicity and volatility [16]. However, inhibition of bacterial growth proves antibacterial activity. Broth dilution enables direct contact between all EO components and the pathogen and allows for the determination of the MIC and subsequent determination of the MBC. Bacteriostatic activity has been defined as a ratio of MBC to MIC of > 4 [21], lower ratios indicate a bactericidal activity. For the EOs analysed in this study, a bactericidal mode of action can be assumed, because their MBC-MIC ratio is 1–2. Broth dilution is considered the more reliable method for analysis of antimicrobial activity of EOs. Nevertheless, agar disc diffusion is used in veterinary routine diagnostics to predict EO activity before therapeutic use (aromagram). For the specific EOs analysed in this study, agar disc diffusion is generally valid, as shown by the comparison of the results of both methods. Two exceptions are the underestimation of cinnamon cassia oil activity and the conflicting results for wintergreen oil. Wintergreen oil immediately precipitates in the broth despite the presence of an emulsifier. In this case, the microdilution has to be interpreted with caution.

![Fig. 1](Image) Depicted is (a) the minimum inhibitory and bactericidal concentration (MIC and MBC) in % of EOs and (b) the inhibition zone radius (IZR) in mm against *P. multocida* (n = 10). Statistically significant results of comparison of MICs or IZR of EOs are given. Conducted was a Kruskal-Wallis test (chi square = 100.94, df = 10, p < 0.001) and post hoc Dunn test with Benjamini-Hochberg adjustment for pairwise comparison. P values of statistically significant differences and indicating asterisks (*p value ≤ 0.05, **p value ≤ 0.01, ***p value ≤ 0.001, - not significant) are stated within the figure. (T) MIC and MBC > 1%
tion. The limitations of agar disc diffusion account for Pasteurella and Mannheimia isolates in the same manner and comparison of differences in their susceptibility are admissible. Predominantly, P. multocida isolates are more susceptible than Mannheimia isolates, which was also observed by others [17, 19]. Moreover, agar disc diffusion of seven EO mixtures was performed. The good antimicrobial activity of all EO mixtures against P. multocida most likely depends on the high content of lemongrass oil (60–70%), which showed strong antimicrobial activity against P. multocida in agar disc diffusion. For determination of the synergic effects of EO mixtures, determination of the fractional inhibitory concentration using checkerboard assays could be performed in future studies.

Only a few studies investigated the antimicrobial activity of EOs against BRD pathogens. Two studies analysed the effect of winter savory and thyme oil against P. multocida [17, 19]. Amat et al. [17] observed good activity of thyme oil (Thymus zygis L.) against one bovine clinical respiratory tract isolate of P. multocida, with an MIC of 0.013%. They [17] also found the MIC equalled the MBC for this Pasteurella isolate, similar to the results obtained in our study. In a study from Salzmann [19], winter savory and thyme oil (Thymus vulgaris L.) showed strong antibacterial activity against bovine P. multocida and M. haemolytica isolates using agar disc diffusion and microdilution, with MICs of 0.39 and 0.63%, respectively. In the same study [19], eucalyptus oil had a weak bacterial effect against P. multocida in agar disc diffusion and inhibited bacterial growth in microdilution, with an MIC of 0.23%. Different MICs of thyme oil obtained in these studies could be explained by different plant species of the thyme used (T. zygis L. and T. vulgaris L.), but all belonging to Thymus herba. EOs as natural plant products can vary in their composition of single chemical compounds due to the plant parts used, extraction methods, region of growth, or harvest season [22]. The antimicrobial activity of an EO can differ depending on its composition [23]. Thus, analysed antimicrobial activities apply for the specific batch of the tested EO within a study. A study by Kissels et al. [24] analysed the antimicrobial activity of the EO components thymol, carvacrol, and 1,8-cineole against bovine type strains of P. multocida and M. haemolytica using microdilution: thymol and carvacrol, which are major components of thyme and winter savory oil, exhibited strong antimicrobial activity. The monoterpenoid 1,8-cineole, which is a major component of eucalyptus oil, had no antibacterial effect [24]. This strong and weak activity of major EO components [24] equates the antimicrobial activity of their EOs found in our study.

Toxic side effects are not expected, as low MICs obtained for most EOs implicate a possible low dose application of EOs. EO preparations could be applied orally or by inhalation, direct nasal, or rectal application. In vitro and in vivo studies demonstrating EO safety and clinical efficiency on respiratory symptoms in animals and humans encourage their future use in veterinary medicine [17, 25–28]. Farah et al. [26] showed that an orally applied EO mixture of eucalyptus, lemon, coriander, rosemary, and Echinacea purpurea (0.015–0.03%) in combination with an injection of tulathromycin reduced respiratory manifestation and improved blood gas values in calves with respiratory disease caused by P. multocida and Haemophilus spp. Inhalation or direct nasal application of diluted EO preparations would enable specific targeting of the respiratory tract. In the literature, it has been reported [17] that in vitro, no cytotoxic effect against bovine turbinate cells could be detected by the use of diluted thyme or eucalyptus oil in concentrations of ≤0.4%. The MIC values for thyme and eucalyptus oil found in our study are below this value, thus safe application of those EOs should be possible while still exerting antibacterial activity. Further, only minimal or no cytotoxic effect could be observed in vitro by LeBel et al. [25] for diluted thyme and winter savory oil (≤0.078%) against porcine tracheal epithelial cells. Human studies showed a short-term beneficial effect of eucalyptus oil inhalation (final air concentration of 0.056%) [27] or nasal application of an EO spray mixture (Eucalyptus citriodora and globulus, Mentha piperita, Origanum syriacim, Rosmarinus officinalis) [28].

Besides antimicrobial activity, other positive effects of EOs might contribute to the host defence against respiratory tract infections. Wu et al. [29] showed that linalool, a major compound of coriander and thyme oil (chemotype linalool), activated the Nrf-2 signalling pathway in a human lung cell line and impaired the expression of pro-inflammatory cytokines of P. multocida. Subcutaneous treatment with linalool also led to enhanced clearance of P. multocida, decreased lung neutrophil accumulation, and improved survival of mice [29]. Additionally, Amat et al. [30] observed only minimal in vitro effects of thyme and eucalyptus oil on commensal microbiota like Lactobacilli, Bacilli, and Staphylococci, which might be able to maintain respiratory health by inhibition of pathogen colonisation.

Overall, cinnamon cassia and lemongrass oil showed the best antimicrobial activity against bovine respiratory tract isolates of P. multocida, followed by coriander, winter savory, and thyme oil. Comparison of microdilution and agar disc diffusion of P. multocida isolates showed reliable results obtained in agar disc diffusion for the specific EOs analysed in this study, except for an underestimation of cinnamon cassia oil activity and inconsistent results of wintergreen oil. Mannheimia isolates were strongly inhibited by cinnamon cassia and thyme oil in agar disc diffusion. Further re-
search is needed to validate the clinical potential, especially of cinnamon cassia, lemongrass, and thyme oil in BRD treatment.

**Material and Methods**

**Bacterial isolates**

Clinical bacterial isolates of *P. multocida* (*n* = 10), *M. haemolytica* (*n* = 10), and *Mannheimia* clade (*n* = 10) were analysed in this study. All *P. multocida*, three *M. haemolytica*, and all *Mannheimia* clade isolates were derived from deep nasopharyngeal swabs of veal calves, sampled within the “outdoor veal calf” project [31]. Nasopharyngeal swabs of the calves were streaked onto *Pasteurella* selective agar purchased from Thermo Scientific Oxoid. Plates were incubated at 37 °C for 24 h. One single colony per plate was selected for species identification with MALDI-TOF MS using Microflex LT from Bruker Daltonik GmbH. Colonies identified as *P. multocida*, *M. haemolytica*, and bacteria in the *Mannheimia* clade (identification on genus level) were purified on trypticase soy agar plates containing 5% sheep blood purchased from Becton Dickinson and incubated at 37 °C for 24 h. Identification was confirmed by MALDI-TOF MS and the isolates were frozen in 30% glycerol stocks at −80 °C.

Seven *M. haemolytica* isolates derived from bovine nose swabs which were sent in for veterinary routine diagnostics to Laboklin GmbH & Co.KG. Since these isolates originated from routine diagnostic samples, no further information on the sampled animals was available and isolates were chosen randomly from the diagnostic pool. Isolates were identified by colony morphology and MALDI-TOF MS with Microflex LT/SH by Bruker Daltonik GmbH. A confidence score was used to rate agreement between the created spectrum and reference spectra provided by the Bruker database. Isolates had confidence scores > 2 allowing for genus and species identification. Bacterial isolates were stored frozen with the CRYOBANK system from Mast Diagnostica at −20 °C without additional additives.

**Essential oils and essential oil mixtures**

The tested EOs (▶ Table 1) and EO mixtures (▶ Table 2) were provided by SaluVet GmbH. Spruce oil was obtained from two different plant types. EO mixtures were composed of EOs that showed the strongest antibacterial activity tested individually. Lemongrass oil, according to results of previously carried out internal examinations, was expected to have a very strong antibacterial effect against all tested microorganisms. Therefore, it was chosen as the main component of all EO mixtures, with a content of at least 60%. Other oils were added in such a concentration that possible synergistic effects were expected to be detectable, whilst lemongrass oil still mainly determined the effect.

**Agar disc diffusion**

All bacterial isolates (*P. multocida* (*n* = 10), *M. haemolytica* (*n* = 10), and *Mannheimia* clade (*n* = 10)) were analysed by agar disc diffusion. Cryopreserved bacteria were recovered at 36 °C on Columbia agar with 5% sheep blood purchased from Becton Dickinson and incubated at 37 °C for 24 h. Identification was confirmed by MALDI-TOF MS and the isolates were frozen in 30% glycerol stocks at −80 °C. Seven *M. haemolytica* isolates derived from bovine nose swabs which were sent in for veterinary routine diagnostics to Laboklin GmbH & Co.KG. Since these isolates originated from routine diagnostic samples, no further information on the sampled animals was available and isolates were chosen randomly from the diagnostic pool. Isolates were identified by colony morphology and MALDI-TOF MS with Microflex LT/SH by Bruker Daltonik GmbH. A confidence score was used to rate agreement between the created spectrum and reference spectra provided by the Bruker database. Isolates had confidence scores > 2 allowing for genus and species identification. Bacterial isolates were stored frozen with the CRYOBANK system from Mast Diagnostica at −20 °C without additional additives.
Microdilution for determination of MIC and MBC was conducted for all 11 EOs against *P. multocida* isolates (*n* = 10) as described by Cermelli et al. [33] with broth and inoculum according to CLSI [34]. Cryopreserved bacteria were recovered at 36°C on Columbia agar.
with 5% sheep blood 24 h before performing microdilution. A two-fold serial dilution of EOs from 1.0–0.0039% was prepared in 96-well plates using CAMHB from Becton Dickinson with 0.5% Tween 20 from Merck Millipore as the emulsifier. Bacterial inoculum adjusted to 0.5 McFarland in sterile NaCl prediluted in CAMHB broth with 0.5% Tween 20 was seeded in prepared 96-well plates. Bacterial inoculum had a final dilution of 1:200 in 100 µL broth per well. A positive growth control with only CAMHB with 0.5% Tween 20 but no EO, and a negative control of the twofold serial dilution of EOs without bacterial inoculum was run alongside. The 96-well plates were sealed with a plastic sheet and incubated at 36°C for 24 h. The MIC was determined visually as the lowest concentration of EO inhibiting visible bacterial growth in 96-well plates. For determination of MBC, 100 µL of suitable wells were plated on Columbia agar with 5% sheep blood along with the positive and negative controls. The MBC was determined as the lowest concentration of EO inhibiting bacterial growth on inoculated agar plates.

**Experimental design**

In this study, activity of 11 EOs against *P. multocida* isolates (n = 10) was analysed using microdilution for the determination of MIC and MBC. Microdilution was performed in triplicate and the mean of each triplicate was used for further statistical analyses. Additionally, the 11 EOs and 7 EO mixtures were screened for their antimicrobial activity against bacterial isolates of *P. multocida* (n = 10), *M. haemolytica* (n = 10), and *Mannheimia* clade against the same EO in agar disc diffusion were analysed with the ARTool of "R" [37] as follows: after the alignment rank transformation to allow for analyses of nonparametric data, a two-way ANOVA was performed for global comparison of differences, followed by a post hoc pairwise comparison with ART-C and Benjamini-Hochberg adjustment.

**Supporting information**

Supporting Information includes graphics on the EO mixture activity against *P. multocida*, *M. haemolytica*, and *Mannheimia* clade (Fig. 15) and on the activity of EO mixtures and their single EO constituents against *P. multocida*, *M. haemolytica*, and *Mannheimia* clade (Fig. 25).

**Contributors’ Statement**


**Acknowledgements**

We thank Prof. Dr. Mireille Meylan from the Clinic for Ruminants, and Prof. Dr. Vincent Perreten from the Institute of Veterinary Bacteriology, Vetsuisse-Faculty, University Bern, for support and supplying bovine bacterial isolates. Bacterial isolates were sampled within the “outdoor veal call” project [founded by the National Research Programme 72 (NRP72) of the Swiss National Science Foundation, project 407240_167083] and isolated at the Institute of Veterinary Bacteriology, Vetsuisse-Faculty, University Bern. This study was funded by SaluVet GmbH and Laboklin GmbH&Co.KG.

**Conflict of Interest**

Philipp Mayer and Lisa Nau are employees of SaluVet GmbH, which provided the essential oils. Vera Becher was an employee of SaluVet GmbH when the study was conducted. The other authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

**References**


**Table 2** The composition of the seven EO mixtures.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EO mixtures</th>
<th>Combinations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2 EOs</td>
<td>1 70% lemongrass + 30% cinnamon cassia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 70% lemongrass + 30% thyme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 70% lemongrass + 30% wintergreen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 70% lemongrass + 30% winter savory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 EOs</td>
<td>5 70% lemongrass + 30% cinnamon cassia + 10% thyme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6 65% lemongrass + 20% winter savory + 15% cinnamon cassia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 EOs</td>
<td>7 60% lemongrass + 15% cinnamon cassia + 15% winter savory + 10% thyme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mannheimia* clade and spruce oil [W(9) = 0.837, p = 0.041] were not normally distributed.

Differences of EO activity for agar disc diffusion and microdilution of *P. multocida* were analysed with the Kruskal-Wallis test for global comparison of differences, followed by Dunn’s post hoc test with Benjamini-Hochberg adjustment for multiple pairwise comparison. Differences of susceptibility of *P. multocida* vs. *M. haemolytica* vs. *Mannheimia* clade against the same EO in agar disc diffusion were analysed with the ARTool of “R” [37] as follows: after the alignment rank transformation to allow for analyses of nonparametric data, a two-way ANOVA was performed for global comparison of differences, followed by a post hoc pairwise comparison with ART-C and Benjamini-Hochberg adjustment.


Coetsee JF, Magstadt DR, Sidhu PK, Follett L, Schuler AM, Krull AC, Cooper VL, Engelken TJ, Kleinheinz MD, O’Connor AM. Association between antimicrobial drug class for treatment and retreatment of bovine respiratory disease (BRD) and frequency of resistant BRD pathogen isolation from veterinary diagnostic laboratory samples. PloS One 2019; 14: e0219104


Amat S, Baines D, Timsit E, Hallevet J, Alexander TW. Essential oils inhibit the bovine respiratory pathogens Mannheimia haemolytica, *Pasteurella multocida* and *Histophilus somni* and have limited effects on commensal bacteria and tumor cells in vitro. *J Appl Microbiol* 2019; 126: 1668–1682


Salzmann BA. Antimikrobielle In-vitro-Wirkung von acht ätherischen Ölen auf *Pasteurella multocida* und Mannheimia haemolytica aus Nasentupferproben von Kälbern [Master Thesis], Bern: Vetsuisse-Faculty; 2019
